REPORT

OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSIONS ON THE EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME "7R091330 - MEDICAL GENETICS" OF ASFENDIYAROV KAZNMU FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION STANDARDS FOR PROGRAMMES OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION (RESIDENCY SPECIALTY) MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION

1) Composition of the External Expert Commission

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 18 of 23.10.2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes of residency specialties of Asfendiyarov KazNMU in the period 18-20.11.2020 in the following composition:



Chairman of the External Expert Commission

TURGUNOV ERMEK MEYRAMOVICH, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the Department of Surgical Diseases of the NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda", President of the NGO "Surgical Association of the Karaganda Region", a member of the International Surgery Society, a member of the "Association of Independent Experts of Astana" and the "Union of Independent experts of KSMU "





Foreign expert

KASHIRSKAYA NATALIA YURIEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Chief Researcher, Laboratory of Genetic Epidemiology, Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution "Medical Genetic Research Centre named after Academician N.P. Bochkov", Moscow, Russian Federation

National academic expert

JUMALINA AKMARAL KANASHEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Head of the Department of Pediatric Diseases with Neonatology NJSC "West Kazakhstan State Medical University named after Marat Ospanov"











National academic expert

RAMAZANOVA RAYGUL MUKHANBETOVNA, MD, Head of the Hematology Course JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"

National academic expert

ESENGARAYEVA SAULE DAMIROVNA, Ph.D., Head of the Department of Medical Rehabilitation with the Course of Sports Medicine JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education"

National academic expert

BEKETOVA BAYAN BEISENGALIEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Assistant of the Department of Clinical and radiation oncology NJSC "Semey Medical University"

National academic expert

AKHMETOVA ALMIRA KALIKAPASOVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Dermatovenereology and Cosmetology NJSC "Semey Medical University"

National academic expert

URAZOVA SALTANAT NURGOZHAEVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor of the Department of General Medical Practice with a course of evidence-based medicine NJSC "Astana Medical University"









National academic expert

KALIEVA SHOLPAN SABATAEVNA, Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate Professor, Head of the Department of Clinical Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"

National academic expert

ZHANTELIEVA LAZZAT ASANOVNA, Doctor of Medical Sciences, Deputy Chairman of the Board for Research Work of JSC "Scientific Centre of Urology named after B.U.Dzharbusynova "

National academic expert MADYAROV VALENTIN MANARBEKOVICH,

Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the Department of Surgery with a course of anaesthesiology and resuscitation, Non-Profit Organization "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

National academic expert

SADIEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA, anaesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the postgraduate education department of the South Kazakhstan Medical Academy JSC

National academic expert

LOVINSKAYA ANNA VLADIMIROVNA, Senior Lecturer of the Department of Molecular Biology and Genetics, Al-Farabi Kazakh National University, Senior Researcher of the Research Institute of Biology and Biotechnology Problems of the RSE "Al -Farabi Kazakh National University"











Expert Representative of Practical Health

ZHOLDASBAYEVA KYRMYZY ZHUMABEKOVNA, Deputy Chief Physician for Childhood PSE on REM "City polyclinic No. 1", Almaty

Expert Representative of Practical Health

NARTPAEVA ASEL TARASOVNA, acting Deputy Chief Medical Officer PSE on REM "City polyclinic No. 30", Almaty

Expert - resident representative

BAYASHOV ERDOS NURIDINULY, resident physician for 3 years of training in the specialty "Anaesthesiology and Resuscitation, including children's» JSC "Kazakh Medical University of Continuing Education".

Expert - resident representative

TARASYUKOV ALEXANDER ANDREEVICH, resident physician for 3 years of training in the specialty "Anaesthesiology and resuscitation, including children's" Non-Profit Organization "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"

ECAQA Observer

UMAROVA MAKPAL ALDIBEKOVNA Head of Accreditation and Monitoring Department

e

2. General part of the final report of the EEC

2.1 Presentation Asfendiyarov KazNMU and the educational residency programme in the specialty "**7R091330** - **Medical genetics**"

In 2020, KazNMU turns 90 and in 2018 the university was reorganized into a non-profit jointstock company (hereinafter - NJSC) by the Resolution of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated April 5, 2018 No. 166 and received the status of a research university (resolution of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 12.11.2018).

In accordance with the Strategy of KazNMU for 2019-2023, the basis of KazNMU's activities is the trinity - the integration of academic, scientific and clinical activities in order to provide highquality and modern medical care to the population and training of professional personnel. In this regard, by 2018, the university included 5 republican state enterprises, including: JSC Scientific Center for Obstetrics, Gynecology and Perinatology, JSC Scientific Center for Pediatrics and Pediatric Surgery, JSC Scientific Research Institute of Cardiology and Internal Medicine , JSC "Kazakh Research Institute of Oncology and Radiology", JSC "Scientific Center of Surgery named after A.N. Syzganov ".

KazNMU is one of the founders of the Academic Demanding League, which aims to improve the quality of education by implementing and promoting the principles of academic honesty. The international information and analytical platform Web of Science in November 2019 awarded KazNMU an independent award "Leader in publication activity in the Web of Science Core Collection over the past 5 years among medical universities of the Republic of Kazakhstan."

KazNMU cooperates with 102 universities, medical and scientific organizations of the near and far abroad, including with TOP-500 universities, implementing joint scientific, research and educational projects.

KazNMU is a full member of international Associations: International Association for Medical Education in Europe (AMEE), European Association of Dental Education (ADEE), World Federation of Dentists (FDI), European Federation of Dentists (EROFDI), European Association of Universities (EUA), International Association of Universities (IUA), the Association of Higher Schools of Management (GSM Barcelona), the World Federation of Pharmacists, the Association for Distance Education "Siberian Open University", the Association of Schools of Public Health in Europe (ASPHER). In 2015, KazNMU became a member of the Association of European Medical Schools (AMSE) and the Organization of PhD Education in Biomedicine and Health Sciences in the European System (ORPHEUS).

Residency was introduced in accordance with the Law "On Education". The first admission to residency was held in 2008. The first issue of residents was carried out in 2010.

For 2020, residency is being implemented in 44 specialties, including 19 educational programmes being accredited for the first time. 605 residents studied at KazNMU from 2017 to 2020. The University trains residents on the basis of 104 clinics, polyclinics, research institutes, and scientific centers. University clinics are: clinic "Aksai", clinic of internal diseases of KazNMU, professorial clinic of KazNMU, dental clinic.

Thus, KazNMU is an innovation-oriented and socially responsible university, a leader in the Republic of Kazakhstan and Central Asia in multi-level training of competitive healthcare and pharmacy specialists through the implementation of a competence-based model of medical and pharmaceutical education with the wide involvement of domestic and foreign scientists and a constant increase in scientific research. potential.

The main educational, scientific and clinical structural unit of the University, which coordinates training at the second stage of medical education in one or more related specialties, is the Dean's Office of Internship and Residency, renamed from August 3, 2020 to the Faculty of Postgraduate Education. The dean's office unites all the departments related to the specialties included in the internship and residency, as well as those general scientific and fundamental departments that, in terms of the content of their work, are closest to the profile of the second level of higher medical education.

2.2 Information on previous accreditation

Accreditation of the educational residency programme in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" has not yet been carried out.

2.3 Analysis of the report on self-assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty ''7R091330 - Medical genetics''

Study Programme Self-Assessment Report presented on 129 pages of the main text, applications on 10 pages and copies or electronic versions of 50 documents on the organization of education, located at the link <u>akr.rezidentura@gmail.com</u> on google disk.

The report is characterized by completeness of responses to all 9 accreditation standards, structuredness taking into account the recommendations of the ECAQA Self-Assessment Guidelines, as well as the internal consistency of information provided by an accredited educational programme in Clinical Pharmacology. The report is accompanied by an accompanying a letter signed by the rector prof. T.S. Nurgozhin, confirming the accuracy of the information and data contained in the report.

The report contains information about the representative of KazNMU, responsible for the selfassessment of educational programmes, Ph.D. Zhankalova Zulfiya Meirkhanovna, Dean of the Faculty of Postgraduate Education.

Self-assessment of educational residency programmes carried out on the basis of an order on the basis of order dated 04.08.2020 No. 337 "On approval of the composition of the working group for preparation for accreditation educational programmes of residency specialties ".

The working group on the preparation of the self-assessment report has done a certain amount of work: the content of the accredited educational programme, the conditions for its implementation, staffing, educational resources have been analysed, the necessary information has been collected in accordance with Accreditation standards for postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational organizations(hereinafter referred to as accreditation standards); a thorough analysis, updating and addition of methodological and educational materials was carried out, their content is reflected in the report. The content of the Self-Assessment Report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards and includes a description of strengths, areas for improvement for each of the 9 standards.

The database, applications on 10 pages, are presented in full, sequentially and there are links to them in the text of the report. The report is written in a competent language, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered.

2.4 General assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" for compliance with the Standards for accreditation of postgraduate education programmes (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions.

Based on the analysis of the self-assessment report by external experts, it was found that the content of the self-assessment report is structured in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards and the recommendations of the Self-Assessment Guidelines, at the same time, based on the results of the external evaluation, recommendations for adjustments were made, which were taken into account by the working group.

The report is written sequentially in compliance with the logic in the description of the standards, the wording for each standard is clear and understandable, the tables contain references in the text and are consecutively numbered. There are links to regulations, model rules, regulations, educational documents, website pages<u>https://kaznmu.kz/rus/postupajushhim/postdiplomnoe-obrazovanie/rezidentura/</u>

The self-assessment and description were carried out in accordance with the criteria of the ECAQA accreditation standards and the questions formulated in the Self-Assessment Guidelines were answered. All standards show the real practice of KazNMU on the training of residents in the

specialty 7R09142 - "Clinical Pharmacology", taking into account the beginning of admission of students in 2018-2019, reasoned data, examples of implementation tasks of the educational programme, national and international events, methodological support, confirming compliance with the requirements of accreditation standards. Self-assessment report description fairly complete and updated software the number of residents, teachers, administration, information on the selection and admission, the results of training, the results of the assessment of knowledge and skills, the material and technical base of the university and clinical bases, contractual obligations with partners (universities, associations, bases), financial information, development plans and improvement, etc.

Conclusion on each of the 9 accreditation standards includes a description of the strengths and areas for improvement identified in the course of introspection and development prospects for the specialty.

Thus, the self-assessment report of the accredited educational residency programme of KazNMU contains objective, detailed, structured information on all types of activities in accordance with the ECAQA accreditation standards, and the university made the appropriate corrections in the report at the external evaluation stage.

Description of external evaluation

External expert work on the assessment of the educational programme of residency "7R091330 - Medical genetics" of KazNMU was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for the External Evaluation of Educational Organisations and Educational Programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of the Non-Profit Institution " Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Higher Education and Health care " No. 5 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on 08.11.2020 by the Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbayeva S.S. and agreed with the rector T.S. Nurgozhin.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the EEC members used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and residents, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of 27 educational and methodological documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

Then a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and the criteria for external assessment of the NCN for compliance with the Accreditation Standards of the residency programme "7R091330 - Medical genetics" of ECAQA medical educational institutions. No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

Chairman of the EEC prof. Turgunov E.M. a final open vote on recommendations for KazNMU and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council were held. Then the chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

Questioning. An observer from ECAQA in November 16-18, 2020 conducted an online survey of KazNMU residents and teachers on the resource <u>https://webanketa.com/</u>.

Residents survey results:

The total number of residents who responded - 154. Of the total number of respondents, residents of the specialty "family medicine" prevailed - 40%, further on the list: pulmonology - 12%,

clinical pharmacology - 12%, therapy - 11%, pediatric oncology and hematology - 6%, general surgery 4%, pediatric surgery 3%, **medical genetics 2%**, other specialties 1% each.

Will recommend this university as an educational organization - 69% fully agree, partially - 26%. 71% of those surveyed fully agree and 23% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. Fully (64%) and partially (29%) are satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms and classrooms of the university. The organization of clinical training for residents, according to 81%, fully satisfies them, and 15% partially. Fully (74%) and partially (22%) are satisfied with the teaching methods. There is enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.) - 82% fully agree, partly 13%. Satisfied with the methods of assessing my knowledge and skills - 78% fully agree, partially 21%. According to 73% of teachers in the classroom, they use active and interactive teaching methods regularly,

According to 81% of the respondents, teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes, but according to 16% - sometimes and 2% - rarely. 81% of respondents are fully satisfied that they are studying at a university, partially 16%, disappointed - 1% of respondents. The university allows you to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty of residency 82% are sure, 7% are not sure, 9% cannot give an answer, 1% would like to believe it, 1% began to doubt it. Fully (76%) and partially (23%) are satisfied with the organization of teaching at KazNMU.

According to 71% of respondents, accreditation is a necessary mechanism for improving educational programmes, but 12% believe that it is not necessary to carry out and 14% doubt the answer. The work of the EEC was assessed as positive - 74%, satisfactory - 14%, i.e., most.

Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes:

The total number of teachers on the list is 40. The total number of respondents is 39, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 18%, up to 10 years - 21%, over 10 years - 62%. 59% are fully satisfied with the organization of the educational process, partially - 33%. At the university, ethics and subordination are respected by 72%, partially - 26%. 67% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially 26%. In the organization there is an opportunity for career growth and development of competence for teachers - 67% fully agree, partially - 26%.

In this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish research results - 72% fully agree, 23% partially. 59% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department, 28% are partially satisfied. The majority of those surveyed have undergone advanced training for the last 5 years. Only 69% fully agree that they can realize themselves as professionals, and 29% partially. Unfortunately, 33% did not answer the question of whether the university supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, and 21% did not address this to the management or the relevant administrative staff of the university. The majority of respondents (74%) fully agree, and 23% partially agree that residents have free access to patients and clinic resources.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate the positive aspects of training in residency programmes, at the same time, they identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, availability of leadership and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers).

Conclusion from the external evaluation:

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were taken into account (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. KP ДCM -16), paragraph 13. It was established that the clinical bases of all residency programmes are 106, which provide training for all levels of medical care (from primary health care to highly specialized). The accredited educational programme has 5 clinical bases, of which one clinic was visited by experts (due to the restriction of visits during a pandemic).

The volume of the study load and treatment and prophylactic work by sections of specialties is determined by the individual work plan of the student of the residency (clause 14) for one year and is monitored by monthly reports of the resident in any form.

In connection with the new edition of order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21. <u>No. KP ДCM_12/2020</u> Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), the educational programme has undergone changes and additions in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, which must participate in the work of the research team.

Also, in accordance with Article 222 of the Residency of Clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "About Health of the People and Health Care System" No. 360-VI ZRK dated July 7, 2020, external experts studied the activities and held conversations with mentors of residents, and it was established that each resident was provided with a mentor. In the specialty of clinical pharmacology, the issue with mentors is difficult to resolve due to the lack of specialists, in the 2019-2020 academic year, 2 clinical mentors were accepted at the department, who are included in the plan for improving pedagogical qualifications.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 2 academic years, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students, nevertheless, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (CEPs, meetings of departments), the assessment of educational programmes (CEP), decision-making on a number of key issues in the choice of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for admission and assessment of residents, development of the content of individual plans of residents and selection of mentors.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the residency educational programme in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" for compliance with the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of an expert assessment, were presented at a meeting with the management on November 20, 2020.

The programme of the 3-day visit of the external expert evaluation of the EEC has been fully completed. On the part of the KazNMU team, the participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of employees of KazNMU, department, employees of clinical bases, responsible for postgraduate education, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

The review of resources showed that the clinical base of JSC "Scientific Centre of Obstetrics, gynaecology and Perinatology" (hereinafter - SCOGP) meets the goals and objectives of the accredited educational programme, the number of thematic patients, modern equipment and its availability to all students, and the department staff provides collegial and ethical relations with the medical staff, the management of the clinical base to achieve the final results of the educational

programme. The clinical base of the SCOGP and outpatient clinics have a wide profile of obstetricgynaecological and pediatric departments, which allows residents to see and supervise a sufficient number of patients with various pathologies. The clinical base has 2 training rooms, despite the fact that residents spend most of their time in the diagnostic departments. Before the start of the relevant discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during training (filling out checklists). Residents have access to the laboratory of the clinical base, where they master the methods of medical genetics: cytogenetic, biochemical, invasive methods of prenatal diagnostics, cytogenetic analysis of bone marrow cells, molecular genetic diagnosis (PCR) of bacterial and viral infections, chromosome synchronization method, molecular cytogenetic FISH- method, molecular genetic testing for hereditary predisposed diseases (endometriosis, recurrent miscarriage, ketosis of pregnant women, cardiovascular diseases, schizophrenia),

The experts studied the documentation of the Department of Medical Genetics, which confirmed the compliance with the accreditation standards (nomenclature of the department's affairs, plan for 5 years, annual plan for 2019-2020 academic year and report for 2019, journal of residents' progress, EMCD, feedback questionnaires with residents , teachers, reports on the results of the questionnaire and the measures taken, the code of ethics, etc., control and measuring instruments), including documentation (plan of financial and economic activities, documents on the QMS, curricula, standard operating procedures, etc.) at the request of members of the EEC ...

3. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" of KazNMU and an overview of the strengths for each standard.

Standard 1: MISSION AND FINAL RESULTS

The staff of the department, implementing the residency programme, as the basis of the mission of the educational programme and goals, accepted the mission of the university and informed the interested parties (teachers, employers, residents) about it in order to clearly understand the tasks and strive to meet the needs of practical healthcare. The structure of the educational programme, where there is a dominance of practical training (75%), the sufficiency of clinical bases and the mentoring system allow strengthening the patient-centred approach in the care and treatment of patients. The university organized training and clinical practice in compliance with safety for all participants in the educational process (safety precautions, use of PPE, instructions before training).

Responsible for the residency programme, the Department of Obstetrics and gynaecology applies a variety of innovations in the learning process, allowing the development of basic and special competencies of residents, namely, work at the patient's bedside, clinical analyses, solving situational problems, protecting medical records, training in laboratories.

At the same time, the involvement of residents in the scientific work of the department is insufficient, is not of a systemic nature (1.1.7), it is more carried out on the initiative of the residents themselves.

The experts received convincing data that the university is autonomous in making decisions in the development of an educational programme in terms of the elective component, the current and final assessment policy, including the choice of assessment methods (testing, oral questioning, clinical examination), selection and admission of residents (specialty exam), personnel policy in relation to teachers on the accredited educational programme, as well as the distribution of resources (classroom fund of clinical bases according to contracts).

The EMCD defines the final learning outcomes in accordance with the qualification requirements for the residency specialty.

The university has developed a Student Ethics Code with which residents are familiarized and work on the development and improvement of communication skills is carried out systematically and integrated into the work programme.

At the same time, the participation of practical health care in the development of the mission and goals of the educational programme is not sufficiently reflected, peer review is formalized and reviews of practical health care are not collected when forming optional components. Mission, key learning outcomes of the educational programme are not widely represented in the information space, this information is not available on the website of the university, clinical base.

Overall, Standard 1 demonstrates compliance.

Strengths:

1) experience in training residents since 2008 and the expansion of training specialties for postgraduate education, provided with the best clinical bases and professional teaching staff.

2) cooperation with practical health care for the training of residents through a mentoring system.

3) clear vision and strategic planning in postgraduate education in the clinical direction and the corresponding management structure.

4) the disciplines taught correspond to the direction of training and state programmes for the development of health care, while elective disciplines are devoted to the study of the most pressing issues of medical genetics.

5) the department carries out strategic partnership with international partners (universities, associations), actively conducts scientific activities

6) filling the shortage of medical geneticists in Kazakhstan

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 17 standards conform: completely - 14, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 1: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) organize work on informing about the mission and the final results of EP training to all interested parties (on the websites of the university, clinical bases, social networks)

2) to formulate the rules for the certification of scientific activities of residents

Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

The accredited residency programme in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" is implemented in accordance with the State Compulsory Standards and Model Professional Curricula for Medical and Pharmaceutical Specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated February 21, 2020 No. KP DSM-12 / 2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of educational programmes of residency with a focus on learning outcomes) for 2 years and during this period, a lot of work has been done to develop educational and methodological materials, organize a place for training residents, form the composition of departments and identify mentors. A model of residents' competencies has been introduced in accordance with the qualification requirements for the specialty. The structure, content and duration of the programme are clearly defined.

The staff of the departments has the necessary competencies for training, at the same time, the mentors represented by the staff of the clinical bases, despite their professional level, do not fully possess pedagogical techniques, which limits the implementation of high-quality transfer of professional knowledge and skills. The teachers of the departments use a variety of methods of active (business games, brainstorming, clinical analyses, case studies, etc.) and traditional (oral analyzes, mini-lectures) training, according to which staff members are periodically trained within the university, less often in other organizations (Nazarbayev University, NJSC "MUK", etc.). The dean's office is trying to monitor this process and, through the School of Pedagogical Skills, train newly hired teachers.

Due to the availability of clinical bases for residents, they spend most of their study time in close contact with patients, medical records, including automated health systems. Residents are taught to work with the latter by mentors. When conducting interviews with residents, the experts

were convinced that the organization of training and work is focused on patients, at the same time, there is not always enough time for theoretical analysis of complex topics and study of literature in modern databases. Clinical training is carried out in the conditions of accredited multidisciplinary clinics and highly specialized scientific centres in Almaty and the region.

In total, according to the accredited educational programme, there is 1 mentor in 1 clinic, who carry out their activities in accordance with the Regulation on mentors. No precedents of inequality, lack of ethics or other violations of a gender, cultural or religious nature have been established in the process of external evaluation.

During the examination of the educational programme, it was established that the scientific foundations and methodology of medical research, evidence-based medicine are applied, at the same time, residents are not fully involved in the scientific work of the departments, they do not have clearly defined research topics, criteria for performing research.

Thus, the educational residency programme in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical Genetics" demonstrates the integration between education and the provision of medical care.

Strengths:

1) there is a model for training residents through the integration of education and clinical training with a sustainable mentoring system.

2) enhanced hands-on training of residents through appropriate specialty programme clinical sites with broad access to resources.

3) professional and experienced teaching staff, ensuring the high-quality implementation of the educational programme.

4) effective mentoring system.

5) formation of a catalogue of elective disciplines, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare and residents

6) residents work with real patients to develop professional competence

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 31 standards conform: completely - 30, significantly -1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 2: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to strengthen the scientific component in the EP, including to intensify the work with databases of hereditary diseases, for example OMIM.

2) an increase in the disciplines of an optional component, including those related to the organization and planning of scientific activities, scientific writing, medical statistics.

Standard 3: EVALUATION OF RESIDENTS

KazNMU has developed and implemented a policy for assessing residents, which includes the principles and methods of assessment, which are reflected in the "Academic Policy of the University" (Order No. 195 of 08/28/2019), Regulations on the current monitoring of progress, intermediate and final certification of students of the NJSC KazNMU. Responsibility for the implementation of the policy for assessing the educational achievements of residents lies with the teaching staff of the departments, heads of departments (modules), the office of the registrar.

The assessment of the educational achievements of residents covers the assessment of key competencies, and the assessment tools themselves are developed by departments / modules - control questions, tasks in test form (MCQ tasks with several options of correct answers), a list of practical skills, situational tasks, clinical situations. Information about the point-rating system of assessment is posted on the website<u>www.kaznmu.kz</u>... As an additional method for assessing residents, the portfolio is used, which the experts got acquainted with at the departments overseeing the residency programmes.

The number of exams in each course is regulated by the Standard Curriculum, which is an integral part of the State Educational Standard of the Republic of Kazakhstan 2017, 2020 in the specialties of residency. The results of educational achievements of students are entered into an

electronic educational journal through the office registrar system and the AIS "Sirius" programme, which automatically generates examination sheets.

The possibility of an appeal based on the results of interim and final certification of residents is determined in the "Academic policy for the 2019-2020 academic year."

The procedure for planning, organizing, monitoring and analysing assessment methods in KazNMU ensures the reliability and validity of these methods. The development of new control and measuring tools is carried out by teachers through the study of world experience in assessing knowledge in residency, then it is introduced at the department. At the same time, no examples of test validation were presented to experts.

In the assessment of residents, clinical mentors are primarily involved, which allows the development of professional behaviour among residents. The level of mastering practical skills is assessed according to the checklist for the implementation of clinical skills (for example, checklists "Phenotypic examination of patients with suspected or established diagnosis of hereditary or congenital pathology, microanomalies taking into account (stigma of dysembryogenesis)", "Participation in the preparation of chromosome preparations "," Compilation of a pedigree, analysis of the pedigree "and others), assessing the actions of the resident on duty. When conducting clinical analyses, "mini-clinical exam", the mentor assesses not only the knowledge and skills of the resident, but also communication skills, including interpersonal interaction with patients with the provision of constructive feedback. Residents of the EP "7R091330 - Medical Genetics" independently conduct questionnaires of recruited patients, comparison and control groups, obtain informed consent, fill out questionnaires on ongoing scientific research, take biological material, participate in various stages of molecular genetic analysis (DNA extraction, amplification, PCR, PCR-real time), participate in the compilation of a database on ongoing scientific research, genetic statistical processing of the obtained data, etc. Before performing research, the resident reports and receives permission to conduct research from the Local Ethics Commission.

Thus, this standard is generally implemented at the university.

Strengths:

1) electronic system "Sirius", providing transparency and speed of recording the results of residents' assessment.

2) a portfolio of residents was introduced, which allows assessing the development of additional competencies of a resident: professional competence, scientific activity, communicative, personal qualities.

3) work with residents is carried out by highly qualified teaching staff and highly qualified clinical mentors.

4) high-quality constructive feedback when assessing students

Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria. Out of 11 standards conform: completely - 11, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) when admitting to residency, provide for combined methods of assessing applicants in order to increase the objectivity of results

2) develop quantitative indicators for the implementation and evaluation of scientific work by residents

3) document the assessment of the validity and reliability of the corporate information system with a view to their continuous improvement

Standard 4: RESIDENTS

The conditions for admitting residents are described in the "Rules for admission to residency" for the corresponding academic year, based on the NLA. Organization and conduct of the entrance exam for EP "7R091330 - Medical Genetics" consists of the average GPA score (30%), the assessment of independent testing conducted by the National Centre for Independent Examination (30%), the entrance exam for EP (30%), the availability of scientific publications (10%), assessed on

a 100-point rating scale. Under the main equal conditions for admission to residency, the length of service (if any), the previous specialty, personal achievements of the applicant, the results of research work, etc. are taken into account. Teachers of the Department of Obstetrics and Gynaecology noted the low level of knowledge of those entering the residency, which is due to the fact that

Citizens are enrolled in residency on a competitive basis, which is carried out separately among persons applying for targeted places. The number of admitted residents is regulated by the State Order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan for the training of medical personnel and taking into account the possibilities of clinical, practical training, the maximum permissible load on the curators, the provision of educational, educational, methodological and scientific literature, the throughput capacity of clinical bases, as well as material and technical resources of KazNMU. In 2020-2021, 3 people are studying for the 1st course of residency "7R091330 - Medical Genetics", for the 2nd year - 2 people.

According to the concluded clinical agreement between the University and the base clinic, residents, under the supervision of clinical mentors (doctors of the clinical base), are allowed to supervise patients, on duty. The resident maintains the necessary documentation (residency diary), which reflects all the work done for the entire period of training under the EP "7R091330 - Medical Genetics".

Strengths:

1) training of residents is carried out at the Scientific Centre for Obstetrics, gynaecology and Perinatology JSC, which is a large scientific institution in Kazakhstan for the implementation of state policy in the field of reproductive health protection;

2) the University conducts resident-oriented education.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 30 standards conform: fully - 28, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 4: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to increase the level of basic education of applicants for residency in genetics;

2) to form the Council of Residents as an internal public organization in identifying and solving problem situations,

3) to carry out a set of measures to ensure comfortable living conditions for residents of other cities.

Standard 5: ACADEMIC STAFF / TEACHERS

The requirements of personnel policy for teaching staff and teachers who carry out training in residency comply with the Charter and the policy of providing human resources to KazNMU, "Rules for the search, selection, admission and adaptation of KazNMU employees" No. 10 dated December 9, 2019. Teachers must meet the following qualification requirements: have a certificate of a specialist / specialist with a category by profile; to be an active specialist in the profile (to receive patients, consult patients, conduct laboratory or instrumental studies, conduct an expert assessment of the use of medicines, etc.); have an academic degree in medical sciences (doctor, candidate, PhD) and / or have an academic title; and / or work experience in the specialty for at least 5 years; have at least 5 years of research experience; have scientific publications in peer-reviewed journals and journals with non-zero impact factor, guidelines, teaching aids, monographs and textbooks; have experience in curriculum development. The following requirements are imposed on clinical mentors involved in teaching to residents from practical healthcare: basic education, medical qualification category and sufficient work experience in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics". The recruitment of teachers for the implementation of the EP is carried out through a competition for filling vacant positions, the procedure for which is regulated by the relevant NLA. Each employee of the department / module undergoes professional development training once every five years. Clinical mentors noted

At the Department of Obstetrics and gynaecology, specializing in "7R091330 - Medical Genetics" currently theoretical training (contact hours - 3 hours for a loan) is conducted by 1 teacher, and practical training (22 hours for a loan) - 1 clinical mentor.

Strengths:

1) The teaching staff of the department consists of highly qualified employees who have scientific achievements, high medical qualifications, are experts in health care and medical education.

2) strengthening the integration of education, science and practice.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 7 standards conform: completely - 6, significantly - 1, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 5: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) draw up a plan of measures to improve the qualifications of pedagogical skills for clinical mentors

2) attracting foreign professors to the educational process

Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES

The University has a developed material and technical base for the implementation of vocational training of residents on the EP "7R091330 - Medical Genetics". The material and technical base of the University includes: lecture halls, study rooms, educational and research laboratories, a library, information technology facilities, premises for the cultural and social sphere, university clinics, and clinical bases. As part of the EP residency "7R091330 - Medical Genetics", training is carried out on the basis of the SCOGP, which includes the Republican Medical and Genetic Consultation, a polyclinic, a prenatal ultrasound diagnostics department and an IVF department. Residents have access to the laboratory of the clinical base, where they master the methods of medical genetics: cytogenetic, biochemical,

KazNMU has a scientific library. The library consists of 5 departments: reference and bibliographic department; department of acquisition and storage of literature; department of scientific processing of literature and cataloguing; department of automation and electronic resources; subscription department for students of all courses of study. The scientific library of KazNMU has signed agreements with international companies for access to bibliographic databases: Web of Sciense, Elsevier (Sciencedirect), Scopus, Cochrane Library, DynaMedPlus, MEDLINE Complete, eBook Clinical Collection, RIEB, Epigraph. However, according to the EP of residency "7R091330 - Medical genetics", the book supply of the main literature is classic textbooks and teaching aids published in 1997-2006, which does not correspond to the "Instructions on the formation of the library fund of the state educational organization of the Republic of Kazakhstan" (order of the Minister of Education and Science of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated July 18, 2003 No. 508), according to which the degree of obsolescence of the main educational publications from the educational fund is natural science and general professional - the last 10 years; special - the last 5 years.

The service of access to the Internet via a fibre-optic channel at a speed of 400 Mbit / sec was organized, without traffic restrictions. The coverage area of the Internet is 100% of the University and clinical sites.

Over the past 5 years, on the clinical basis of residency in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics", the achievements of medical science have been introduced into health care practice on medical genetics: methodological recommendations - 2, acts of implementation - 5, republican patent - 2.

The possibility of training residents in other medical organizations is provided by agreements of KazNMU with Health Departments of 8 regions of the Republic of Kazakhstan and 16 agreements / memoranda with foreign universities and research centres in 27 countries of the world. The experience of the best foreign practices in the field of medical education for residents is carried out through the programme "Academic mobility of students" and "Visiting professor of KazNMU".

Strengths:

1) for the training of residents there is a material and technical base, access to laboratories at clinical bases;

- 2) the possibility of participation of residents in the scientific areas of the department;
- 3) access to international bibliographic databases.
- *4*) creation of a DNA biobank with the participation of residents within the framework of an international project.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 18, significantly - 2, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

Standard 6: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) ensure the updating of professional educational literature in the field of training, including publishing their own textbooks and teaching aids,

2) allocate loans in the programme of training residents for scientific research

Standard 7: EVALUATION OF THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME

Monitoring and evaluation of the EP is carried out at all levels, including the profiling / graduating and related departments, the profile Committee of the educational programme, the Department of Academic Development, the Academic Committee, the Senate, the student government, the Centre for Admission and Career Guidance of Students (general monitoring of the quality of educational programmes through a survey of interested parties (employers, professional associations and trainees)).

The QMS department is constantly working to determine the satisfaction of internal and external consumers of the University. All stakeholders (faculty, students, employers) are involved in the programme evaluation process through representation in the relevant structures. The work of all structures that ensure the implementation and evaluation of the educational programme is regulated by the Charter of the university, the Strategic Development Plan of the university, annual plans and reports of the university, as well as the relevant QMS procedures. The results of the assessment are heard at meetings of the clinical council, faculty councils, MC and SC, published in the university newspaper and on the university website.

To monitor the implementation of the educational programme and as problems arise, including those related to resource provision, the University has the following documents: the Concept for the Development of the Quality of Education (order No. 644 of June 27, 2014), SOP "Formation, discussion of educational programmes (EP) "(order No. 600 of 08/02/2018), Regulation on the development and implementation of joint and integrated educational programmes (order No. 786 of 09/08/2014), SOP " Organization of methodological work " (order No. 600 of 02.08. 2018), SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of QED" (order No. 600 dated 02.08.2018), SOP "Monitoring the quality of the educational process, the use of active teaching methods and multilingualism in the departments" (order No. 4 dated 14.01.2020 g.), etc.

Strengths:

1) involvement in the assessment of the EP "7R091330 - Medical genetics "of students, teachers, employers;

2) external and internal assessment of the EP "7R091330 - Medical genetics "is carried out by the leading specialists of the Republic of Kazakhstan in the field of medical genetics;

3) final certification of graduates takes place with the participation of independent examiners.

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 13, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 7: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) annually form and adjust the 5-year plan of the department to improve the professional and pedagogical skills of teachers and clinical mentors;

2) to attract methodologists to help teachers in the preparation of syllabuses and other documents of the EMCD,

3) improve the efficiency of the Committee of educational programmes, the Department for educational and methodological work of the University

Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION

KazNMU implements the EP on residency "7R091330 - Medical genetics" in accordance with the NLA approved by the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, as well as internal rules for organizing the educational process in residency.

Students who have mastered the EP of residency "7R091330 - Medical genetics" and have successfully passed state certification are issued a state-recognized document on the conferment of a doctor's qualifications in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics", a certificate of completion of residency, a certificate of a specialist without a category in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics ...

The Academic Committee organizes and considers the implementation of various forms of methodological work aimed at improving the educational process.

Determination of the financial and economic policy of KazNMU and the management structure of the university is the responsibility of the first head of the university - the rector, Chairman of the Board and the Department of Economics and Finance. The university budget is formed from the republican budget (state order for the training of university and postgraduate education personnel, advanced training of medical workers, the development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

Ensuring the implementation of residency programmes consists of the salary fund for the teachers of residency, providing students with educational resources (educational and scientific literature, access to the Internet and to international information databases of literature, information and communication technologies), strengthening the programme through invited foreign teachers, academic mobility programmes and the opportunity for residents to participate in international and republican conferences, seminars.

To ensure effective planning of the implementation of the educational programme, the Department of Administrative and Personnel Work, the Department of Economics and Finance, and the Department of Academic Work by the beginning of the academic year form a staffing table (number of teaching hours, number of teachers). The Department of Public Procurement and Analysis annually at the beginning of the academic year collects applications for the purchase of goods that support the implementation of the educational residency programme. Since January 2020, financial management has been provided to the dean's office. The Department of Clinical Work oversees the conclusion of contracts with clinical bases, where the departments implementing residency programmes are located.

Strengths:

1) continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals;

2) transparency of the management system and decisions made;

3) the responsibility of the academic leadership in relation to the development and management of the educational programme is determined;

4) active collaboration with partners in the health sector

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 13, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

Standard 8: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

1) to include in the staff of the Department of Obstetrics and gynaecology a methodologist to assist in the development of syllabuses and other educational and methodological documents;

2) apply to the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the possibility of solving the problem of employment of graduates of residency in non-state Republican research medical centres

Standard 9: CONTINUOUS IMPROVEMENT

As part of the continuous improvement of the educational process, the University conducts an analysis of the implementation of the EP, taking into account the needs of practical healthcare in the Republic of Kazakhstan and residents. In this case, the review procedure is carried out at 3 levels and is accompanied by a documentation procedure:

1) university administration and management, working groups on examination and evaluation of curricula, teaching and evaluation methods, development and monitoring of residents' portfolios, examination of the catalogue of elective disciplines, QMS audit - once a year, analysis is carried out for compliance with fundamental concepts and criteria of the European Model of Excellence;

2) internal audit (head of the department) on the basis of an individual teacher's plan, an individual plan of a resident, MAC (the annual plan is approved at the beginning of the academic year) - once a year, with discussion at the department meeting and inclusion in the annual report of the department;

3) feedback from residents and teachers is implemented through a questionnaire.

Training in residency for the EP "7R091330 - Medical genetics "is carried out in accordance with the State Educational Standard of Residency in medical specialties, a standard professional curriculum for medical specialties of residency and standard curricula for medical specialties of residency, approved by Order No. 647.

To implement the task of achieving learning outcomes by students and their changes in accordance with the needs of the labour market and health care, EP "7R091330 - Medical Genetics" is built in such a way that residents have an understanding of modern socio-economic, demographic, cultural characteristics of medical problems, and the level of acquired clinical knowledge and skills matched the needs of the health care system and society in medico-genetic care.

Strengths:

1) continuous organizational, coordination and administrative work aimed at achieving the mission and goals;

2) transparency of the management system and decisions made;

3) high academic assessment of achievements and final learning outcomes;

EEC conclusions by criteria. Out of 4 standards correspond: completely - 4, significantly - 0, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

Standard 9: completed

Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:

2) document the assessment of the validity and reliability of the corporate information system with a view to their continuous improvement

3) monitor the efficiency and quality of work of the University departments and training of residents

Thus, all 9 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfilment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analysing the self-assessment report and conducting the examination as part of the tasks of the external peer review programme were found.

5. Recommendations for improving the educational programme of residency in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" KazNMU:

1) to organize work on informing about the mission and the final results of EP training to all interested parties (on the websites of the university, clinical bases, social networks);

2) to formulate the rules for attestation of the scientific activities of residents, in particular, by prescribing the scientific component in thematic plans in the form of the implementation and protection of scientific projects;

3) document the assessment of the validity and reliability of the corporate information system with a view to their continuous improvement;

4) when admitting to residency, provide for combined methods for assessing applicants in order to increase the objectivity of results;

5) to increase the disciplines of the optional component, including those related to the organization and planning of scientific activities, scientific writing, medical statistics;

6) to strengthen the scientific component in the EP, including to activate the work of residents with databases of hereditary diseases (for example, OMIM);

7) to enhance academic mobility in foreign universities, exchange of residents and teaching staff on high-tech methods of diagnosis and treatment;

8) to increase the coverage of academic residency teachers in teaching innovative teaching methods.

9) to provide for the improvement of the teaching qualifications of the teaching staff of the residency not only in the universities of the Republic, but also in foreign universities;

10) provide for the training of clinical mentors from among doctors of practical health care in pedagogy and psychology;

11) to document the representation of residents to participate in the development and implementation of the EP of residency (for example, the Council of Residents or other advisory body);

12) update the map of book availability with basic educational literature in the specialty;

13) to improve the efficiency of the CEP, the Department for educational and methodological work of the University in terms of the assessment and unification of syllabuses;

14) to introduce a methodologist into the staff of the department to help in the preparation of syllabuses and other documents of the EMCD;

15) raise awareness of residents about the possibilities of material and social assistance from the university;

16) introduce an assessment of the educational activities of clinical mentors through the eyes of residency graduates;

17) to raise the level of basic education of applicants for residency in genetics;

18) to apply to the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan on the possibility of solving the problem of employment of graduates of residency in non-state Republican research medical centres;

19) monitor the efficiency and quality of work of the University departments and training of residents

7. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend that the Accreditation Council accredit the educational residency programme in the specialty "7R091330 - Medical genetics" for a period of 5 years.

Chairman		Turgunov Ermek		
		Meyramovich		
The foreign expert	Jefang	Kashirskaya Natalia Yurievna		
Academic expert	A	Zhumalina Akmaral Kanashevna		
Academic expert	Arrell/	Ramazanova Raigul Mukhanbetovna		
Academic expert	ceruo	Esengaraeva Saule Damirovna		
Academic expert	the	Beketova Bayan Beysengalievna		
Academic expert	M	Akhmetova Almira Kalikapasovna		
Academic expert		Urazova Saltanat Nurgozhaevna		
Academic expert	A	Kalieva Sholpan Sabataevna		
Academic expert	- Th	Zhantelieva Lyazzat Asanovna		
Academic expert	Ann	Madyarov Valentin Manarbekovich		
Academic expert	tot	Sadieva Zhanar Zamankhanovna		
Academic expert	<i>f</i> q	Lovinskaya Anna Vladimirovna		
Representative of practical health care	fighter	Zholdasbaeva Kyrmyzy Zhumabekovna		
Representative of practical health care	E.baul	Nartpayeva Asel Tarasovna		
The representative of the residents	Am	Bayashov Erdos Nuridinuly		
The representative of the		Tarasyukov Alexander		

residents	Andreevich		
The observer ECAQA	Umarova Makpal Aldibekovna		

Attachment 1.

Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) Of educational programme in the specialty of residency ''7R091330 - Medical genetics'' KazNMU

-	/K091550 - Mieuicai genetic				
		Evaluation			
Standard	Evaluation criteria	olies	mpliant	mpliant	lies
	Number of standards = BS*/SU	Fully complies	Largely compliant	Partially compliant	Fully complies
1.	MISSION AND OUTCOMES 17 = 10/7	8/6	2/1		
2.	EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME 31 = 22/9	21/9	1/0		
3.	ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES	7/4			
	11 = 7/4				
4.	TRAINEES	16/12	2/0		
	30 = 18/12				
5.	TRAINERS	4/2	1/0		
	7 = 6/1				
6.	EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES	9/9	1/1	0/1	
7.	7 = 5/2 PROGRAMME EVALUATION	8/5	2/0		
/.	PROGRAMME EVALUATION $21 = 10/11$	0/0	2/0		
8.	GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION	6/7	2/0		
	15 = 10/5	0, 1	_, •		
9	CONTINUOUS RENEWAL	1/3			
	4 = 1/3				
		80/57			
	Total: 151 = 91/60				

* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and the fulfilment must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational and scientific organization.

Appendix 2.

List of documents requested by members of the EEC in the framework of specialized accreditation

Ν	Names of documents	amount	Date approved
0.			
1.	Syllabuses of disciplines	8	20.09.2020 г.
2.	Practical skills checklists	17	20.09 2020 г.
3.	SOP "Development and approval of a system for assessing educational achievements"	1	08.09.2020 г.
4.	SOP "Compilation, discussion, approval of syllabuses"	1	19.08.2020 г.
5.	SOP "Rules for Conducting the Results of Interim Certification (Examination Session)"	1	13.01.2020 г.
6.	SOP "Conducting current monitoring of progress"	1	11.11.2019 г.
7.	SOP "Acquisition of educational literature"	1	02.08.2018 г.
8.	SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of working curricula of teaching load"	1	02.08.2018 г.
9.	SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of QED"	1	02.08.2018 г.
10.	SOP "Formation, discussion, approval of educational programmes"	1	02.08.2018 г.
11.	SOP "Examination of instrumentation in testing format"	1	02.08.2018 г.
12.	SOP "Organization and conduct of methodological work at the University"	1	02.08.2018 г.
13.	QMS documents	11	09.12.2019 г.
14.	Resident portfolio	5	-